

# CICMHE Design Competition – Judges Scoring Sheet

Team ID: \_\_\_\_\_

Possible Points	Team Points
100	

<p><b>Presentation Style and Impression</b> Free of spelling and grammatical errors; readability; appropriate headings; style of presentation supports key points.</p>	10	
<p><b>Executive Summary Letter to the Management Team</b> One page or less; well-written; presents situation and rationale for proposed solution.</p>	5	
<p><b>Introduction</b> Overviews problem and operations; briefly discusses project thrust.</p>	5	
<p><b>Problem Statement</b> Concise description of issues; what is wrong; who is being affected; how bad is it?</p>	10	
<p><b>Product Flow</b> A successful proposal will explain how the data provided were analyzed to determine the appropriate product flow in the facility and how the design provides for the desired flow.</p>	10	
<p><b>Equipment Selection</b> A successful proposal will explain how the data provided were analyzed to determine the appropriate equipment in the facility and how the proposed equipment meets the objectives specified for the facility.</p>	5	
<p><b>Space Utilization</b> A successful proposal will evaluate the utilization of cubic capacity based on the layout and equipment recommended for the facility and how the proposed design meets the objectives specified for the facility.</p>	5	
<p><b>Operational Plan</b> A successful proposal will explain how the data provided were analyzed to determine the appropriate operational plan for the facility and how the design provides for the desired operational plan. This includes the job requirements, use of all equipment, integration of any information technology, and guidelines for running this operation efficiently and safely for employees.</p>	10	
<p><b>Implementation Plan</b> A successful proposal will provide an implementation plan for the proposed design that allows the project objectives to be reached without impacting existing activities (if applicable).</p>	10	

<p><b>Economic Justification</b> A successful proposal will provide an economic analysis that justifies the cost of the proposed design (including capital and ongoing costs) based on the benefits that the proposed design provides.</p>	<b>10</b>	
<p><b>Overall Integration</b> A successful proposal will explain how the new equipment and operations will be integrated into the existing facility.</p>	<b>5</b>	
<p><b>Conclusions</b> Restate major findings and recommendations; nothing new should be introduced.</p>	<b>5</b>	
<p><b>Overall Quality of Presentation (emphasis here is on content, not appearance)</b> Overall is the report well-written; accurate; concise; comprehensive/thorough; well organized; easy to follow; well-integrated; good balance of discussion; salesmanship.</p>	<b>10</b>	

### Summary Judges Comments

<p>The strongest part of this entry was...</p> <p><i>(please include one paragraph summarizing the strong points of the entry)</i></p>	
<p>The entry would have been more convincing if...</p> <p><i>(please include one paragraph summarizing the weaker points of the entry)</i></p>	